

Program Cost-Effectiveness - 2009 ACTUAL

	Total Resource Benefit/Cost Ratio	Present Value						Summer kW Savings	Number of Members Served
		Benefit (\$000)	Utility Costs (\$000)	Member Costs (\$000)	Lifetime Savings MWh	Winter kW Savings	Summer kW Savings		
Residential Programs									
ENERGY STAR Homes	4.48	\$ 578.9	\$ 94.4	\$ 34.7	670.0	2.0	1.0	27	
Home Energy Solutions	1.96	\$ 282.7	\$ 131.0	\$ 13.4	3,050.0	52.0	17.0	27	
ENERGY STAR Lighting *1	3.87	\$ 615.1	\$ 90.2	\$ 68.6	8,220.0	150.0	40.0	28,445	
ENERGY STAR Appliances	1.56	\$ 455.5	\$ 121.4	\$ 170.9	2,463.0	26.0	25.0	1,252	
High Efficiency Heat Pump Load Management	3.71	\$ 635.5	\$ 96.8	\$ 74.6	11,105.0	250.0	13.0	13	
	0.00	\$ -	\$ 117.3	\$ -	-	-	-	-	
Subtotal Residential	2.53	\$ 2,567.6	\$ 651.0	\$ 362.2	25,508.0	480.0	96.0	29,764	
Home Energy Assistance	1.78	\$ 303.1	\$ 170.1	\$ -	1,155.0	17.0	11.0	51	
Subtotal Residential HEA	1.78	\$ 303.1	\$ 170.1	\$ -	1,155.0			51	
Commercial/Industrial Programs									
New Construction / Major Renovation	2.14	\$ 450.0	\$ 80.9	\$ 129.4	7,074.0	19.0	24.0	7	
Large C&I Retrofit	1.80	\$ 710.6	\$ 135.1	\$ 260.7	10,369.0	113.0	49.0	16	
Small C&I Retrofit	0.94	\$ 185.4	\$ 113.0	\$ 83.3	2,274.0	14.0	29.0	29	
Other (Education)	0.00	\$ -	\$ 19.5	\$ -	-	-	-	-	
Other	0.00	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	-	-	-	-	
Smart Start		\$ -	\$ 0.2	\$ -	-	-	-	-	
Subtotal C&I	1.64	\$ 1,346.0	\$ 348.4	\$ 473.4	19,717.0	146.0	102.0	52	
Total		\$ 4,216.8	\$ 1,169.6	\$ 835.5	\$ 46,380.0	\$ 626.0	\$ 198.0	\$ 29,867.0	

Program Cost-Effectiveness - 2009 PLAN

	Total Resource Benefit/Cost Ratio	Present Value				Lifetime MWh Savings	Number of Members Served
		Benefit (\$000)	Utility Costs (\$000)	Member Costs (\$000)			
Residential Programs							
ENERGY STAR Homes	1.17	\$ 161.9	\$ 113.1	\$ 25.5	124.0	23	
Home Energy Solutions	1.24	\$ 191.1	\$ 139.1	\$ 14.5	1,416.0	35	
ENERGY STAR Lighting ¹	2.68	\$ 330.0	\$ 90.7	\$ 32.6	4,519.0	13,838	
ENERGY STAR Appliances	1.47	\$ 264.4	\$ 93.7	\$ 86.0	1,384.0	956	
High Efficiency Heat Pump Load Management	1.55	\$ 283.7	\$ 87.3	\$ 95.4	5,077.0	15	
	0.00	\$ -	\$ 104.7	\$ -	-	-	
Subtotal Residential	1.39	\$ 1,231.0	\$ 628.6	\$ 254.0	12,520.0	14,867	
Home Energy Assistance	1.28	\$ 206.2	\$ 160.8	\$ -	571.0	46	
Subtotal Residential HEA	1.28	\$ 206.2	\$ 160.8	\$ -	571.0	46	
Commercial/Industrial Programs							
New Construction / Major Renovation	2.07	\$ 535.0	\$ 133.7	\$ 124.6	5,414.0	14	
Large C&I Retrofit	3.08	\$ 1,274.8	\$ 131.3	\$ 282.3	15,109.0	18	
Small C&I Retrofit	1.37	\$ 188.3	\$ 92.7	\$ 45.0	2,335.0	15	
Other (Education)	0.00	\$ -	\$ 29.1	\$ -	-	-	
Other	0.00	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	-	-	
Smart Start		\$ -	\$ 15.3	\$ -	-	-	
Subtotal C&I	2.34	\$ 1,998.1	\$ 401.9	\$ 451.9	22,858.0	47	
Total		\$ 3,435.3	\$ 1,191.3	\$ 705.8	35,949.0	14,960	

Note 1: Plan includes 3,459 members purchasing a total of 13,838 lighting products.

Member Incentive Calculation
 2009

	<u>Planned</u>	<u>Actual</u>
Commercial/Industrial Incentive		
1. Benefit/Cost Ratio	2.34	1.64
2. Threshold Benefit / Cost Ratio ¹	1.00	
3. Lifetime kWh Savings	22,858,000	19,717,000
4. Threshold Lifetime kWh Savings (65%) ²	14,857,700	
5. Budget	\$ 436,848	\$ 375,742
6. Benefit / Cost Percentage of Budget	4.00%	
7. Lifetime kWh Percentage of Budget	4.00%	
8. C/I Member Incentive	\$34,948	\$27,302
9. Cap (12%)	\$52,422	
 Residential Incentive		
10. Benefit / Cost Ratio	1.63	2.83
11. Threshold Benefit / Cost Ratio ¹	1.00	
12. Lifetime kWh Savings	13,091,000	26,663,000
13. Threshold Lifetime kWh Savings (65%) ²	8,509,150	
14. Budget	\$ 858,093	
15. Benefit / Cost Percentage of Budget	4.00%	
16. Lifetime kWh Percentage of Budget	4.00%	
17. Residential Incentive	\$68,647	\$102,971
18. Cap (12%)	\$102,971	
 19. TOTAL INCENTIVE EARNED		 \$130,273

Notes

1. Actual Benefit / Cost Ratio for each sector must be greater than or equal to 1.0.
2. Actual Lifetime kWh Savings for each sector must be greater than or equal to 65% of projected savings.

Planned Versus Actual Benefit / Cost Ratio by Sector
 2009

	<u>Planned</u>	<u>Actual</u>
Commercial & Industrial:		
1. Benefits (Value) From Eligible Programs	\$ 1,998,091	\$ 1,346,020
2. Implementation Expenses	\$ 436,848	\$ 375,742
3. Member Contribution	<u>\$ 416,910</u>	<u>\$ 446,048</u>
4. Total Costs Including Member Incentive	\$ 853,758	\$ 821,790
5. Benefit/Cost Ratio - C&I Sector	2.34	1.64
Residential:		
6. Benefits (Value) From Eligible Programs	\$ 1,437,210	\$ 2,870,760
7. Implementation Expenses	\$ 858,093	\$ 924,091
8. Member Contribution	<u>\$ 24,493</u>	<u>\$ 89,099</u>
9. Total Costs Including Member Incentive	\$ 882,586	\$ 1,013,190
10. Benefit/Cost Ratio - Residential Sector	1.63	2.83

Actual Lifetime Energy Savings by Sector and Program
 2009

	Lifetime kWh Savings	
	<u>Planned</u>	<u>Actual</u>
Commercial & Industrial:		
New Construction / Major Renovation	5,414,000	7,074,000
Large C&I Retrofit	15,109,000	10,369,000
Small C&I Retrofit	2,335,000	2,274,000
Other (Education)	0	0
Other	0	0
Other	<u>0</u>	<u>0</u>
 Total Commercial & Industrial Included for Incentive Calculation	 22,858,000	 19,717,000
Residential:		
Home Energy Assistance Program	571,000	1,155,000
Home Energy Solutions Program	1,416,000	3,050,000
ENERGY STAR Homes Program	124,000	670,000
ENERGY STAR Appliance Program	1,384,000	2,463,000
ENERGY STAR Lighting Program	4,519,000	8,220,000
Load Management Program	0	0
High Efficiency Heat Pump	<u>5,077,000</u>	<u>11,105,000</u>
 Total Residential Included for Incentive Calculation	 13,091,000	 26,663,000

2009 End of Year Reconciliation

	<u>2009</u>
Carry Forward Balance	\$ 140,286
Funding:	
System Benefit Charge	\$ 1,276,079
Interest	8,934
Total Funding for 2009 Energy Efficiency Programs	<u>\$ 1,285,013</u>
Expenses:	
Energy Efficiency Expenditures ¹	\$ 1,097,590
Member Incentive - 2008 ²	134,164
Member Incentive - 2009 ³	130,273
Total 2009 Program Expenses	<u>\$ 1,362,027</u>
Carry Forward Balance	<u><u>\$ 63,272</u></u>

1. Includes FCM revenue of \$87,981

2. 2008 member incentive accrued in 2008 and booked in 2009

3. 2009 member incentive accrued in 2009 and booked in 2010